MANUSCRIPT EVALUATION FORM FOR SUBMISSIONS IN LITERATURE

Please complete this evaluation form (or write your own response on a separate sheet) and return it within a month of receipt. If you make marginal notes on the manuscript that you intend to be of assistance to the author/Editor, please return the manuscript as well. Answers and comments may be in either English or Japanese. The identity of the referees is kept in strict confidence—unless you give written permission otherwise. Please be candid. But constructive comments—that can be shared verbatim with the author—are most appreciated. Thank you for your prompt and thoughtful response.

1. Is this paper a contribution to the field?

2. If so, how?

3. Will it be of interest/value to the Association membership?

4. What do you see as the main argument(s) of this paper?

5. Is the author successful in supporting the paper’s argument(s)?

6. Is the title appropriate or would you suggest a different one?

7. Are facts, translations, etc., accurate?

8. Are the author’s conclusions and comments justified by the information presented?

9. If you feel another opinion of this paper is necessary, whom do you recommend?

10. Overall rating: 
    _____Publish
        _____Recommend publication with minimal revision as indicated
        _____Borderline; recommend extensive revision and re-review
        _____Reject

(If you feel rewriting or extensive revision is required, please be specific to assist the Editor in advising the author.)

Signature_________________________________________ Date_________________